Language Death

At the Triennial Translation Workshop in June, UBS translation consultants heard two papers on the subject of language death—Annie del Corro’s “Language Endangerment and Bible Translation,” and Joseph Hong’s “The Dying of Languages and Bible Translation: Some Reflections.” (The papers will be published in revised form in the April issue of The Bible Translator.) As the titles suggest, both papers discuss the implications of language endangerment and death for Bible translation. It is the aim of this brief survey, then, not to explore that important issue, but to provide additional information on the many resources available for learning about language endangerment.

Hong and del Corro wrote out of their experience as translation consultants in an organization with a limited scope, but they also form part of a larger worldwide group of concerned observers of language, a group that has become more and more vocal, especially in the 1990s. Now ten years old, but still an excellent survey of the global situation, Endangered Languages (1991) has separate chapters on the endangered languages of the U.S., Canada, South America, Mexico, Africa, India, Southeast Asia, CEFSU, and Australia, Oceania, and Indonesia, as well as a general discussion of the causes and circumstances of language endangerment and death. Authors of the regional articles survey the extent and causes of language loss and death in their respective regions.

Other collected works that include studies of language situations throughout the world are Language Choices, Language Death 1992, Papers on Language Endangerment, Studies in Endangered Languages, Endangered Languages (1998), Maintenance and Loss, and Investigating Obsolescence.

Most recently, two books published this year serve as complementary introductions to the subject, and indicate the commitment of specialists to putting the issues before a general audience. Crystal’s Language Death is perhaps the more accessible and concise account of the problem, written in a tone of urgency and advocacy that can be sensed already in his chapter titles: What is language death? Why should we care? Why do languages die? Where do we begin? and What can be done?

While Nettle and Romaine’s book Vanishing Voices also has the air of sounding an alarm, it investigates the causes of language death in greater depth, going back 10,000 years to the rise of agricultural societies as a first cause, and looking more closely at the correlations between biological and linguistic diversity and the impact of biological and economic changes. Nettle, an anthropologist, had already explored some of these issues in Linguistic Diversity (Oxford, 1998), and others have drawn the same parallels, demonstrating how factors responsible for biological diversity contribute to linguistic diversity, and how the influences that lead to the extinction of species also contribute to the loss of linguistic diversity (Harmon 1996).

In these books and in the many case studies and theoretical articles by linguists, central questions that are addressed are: What are the external and internal (political, social, economic) factors that lead to language death and what are the social and linguistic indicators of a dying language? (See Clairis,
Dressler, McConvell, many of the
articles in Investigating Obsoles-
cence and Endangered Languages
1991, Sasse and Myers-Scotton in
Language Death 1992, Clyne and
Edwards in Maintenance and
Loss, Sommers) Should (or can)
anything be done to preserve
languages? (Ladefoged, Dorian
1993) If so, what are effective
remedies? (Dorian 1994, Paulston,
et al., Spolsky, Bernard)
Not all agree that the demise
of languages is necessarily a bad
thing: In response to a Language
special section devoted to a global
assessment of the situation of en-
dangered languages (Vol. 68,
1992), P. Ladefoged, who is him-
self involved in documenting the
phonetic structures of endangered
and dying languages, challenges
the assumption that languages
should always be preserved. Lin-
guists and other outsiders risk pa-
ternalism or politically motivated
involvement if they try to impose
their ideas about what is best for
speakers of a given language. In
contrast to the finality of species
extinction, he claims that cultural
diversity is constantly renewing
itself. The position is more starkly
stated in a New York Times article
(“Speak, Cultural Memory.”
A17,19, Sept. 30, 2000), where M.
Blake, a professor of philosophy at
Harvard, is quoted as saying,
“Languages have died throughout
human history…It is not immedi-
ately clear to me why we should
try to preserve them.”

Web Resources on Endangered Languages

- Terralingua’s main aims are to support linguistic diversity through a program of research, information, applied work, and advocacy. Listed at this site are institutions and organizations dedicated to the study and maintenance of indigenous and minority languages, the MIT bibliography (Papers on Language Endangercement) and other bibliographies, conference report links, and discussion papers—currently 16 of them. Terralingua publishes a print newsletter. http://www.terralingua.org/
- The Endangered Languages Project documents weaker languages of Pacific Rim minorities, giving priority to languages that children are no longer acquiring as mother tongues, a key sign that their existence is in peril. The research involves gathering and sorting records from previous linguistic surveys; undertaking new fieldwork; recording, organizing, and analyzing linguistic data; and publishing the results (dictionaries, grammars, textbooks, etc.) and entering the information into databases. http://critical.bun.kyoto-u.ac.jp/outline_e.htm
- Endangered Languages—a short course by Marcelo Dascal, Tel Aviv University http://spinoza.tau.ac.il/hci/vip/papers/dascal1/index.htm
- Gesellschaft für bedrohte Sprachen. The goal of this organization is to further the use, preservation, and documentation of endangered languages and dialects. http://www.uni-koeln.de/gbs/
- The International Clearing House for Endangered Languages. Links to the UNESCO Red Books on endan-
ergled languages can be found here. http://www.tooyoo.l.u-tokyo.ac.jp/ichel.html
- Endangered-Languages-L. This email discussion list aims to provide a communications vehicle and central archive for those interested in the study of endangered languages. Instructions for joining the list, as well as other information on the subject, can be found at http://carmen.murdoch.edu.au/lists/endangered-languages-l/
- Foundation For Endangered Languages has extensive links to other organizations and pages and publishes a newsletter online (Ogmios, formerly Iatiku). FEL aims to raise awareness of endangered languages; to support the use of endangered languages in all contexts; to monitor linguistic policies and practices; to support the documentation of endangered languages; to collect and make available information of use in the preservation of endangered languages; to disseminate information on all of these activities. http://www.ogmios.org/
- The Endangered Language Fund supports efforts by native communities in maintaining endangered lan-
guages or scholars planning to work with a language, including such work as preserving the texts of a native culture, preparing videotaped instruction in the language, and support for “generation skipping” language learning. http://sapr.ling.yale.edu/~elf/
- Ethnologue. B. Grimes, ed., is the only regularly updated attempt to list all the world’s languages and their
status. The 13th (1996) edition is on-line, can be searched by language, country or language family, and includes interactive maps: http://www.sil.org/ethnologue/ Also at the SIL site is an article on endangered languages by Gloria Kindell with additional references and resources: http://www.sil.org/sociolx/ndg-lg-grps.htm
- Selected Resources on Endangered Languages: http://zeus.bris.ac.uk/~pyarw/el-list.html
- Bibliography on Language Endangerment: http://www.tooyoo.l.u-tokyo.ac.jp/~tsunoda/dlg_lst.html
Nettle & Romaine make the case that preservation of local ecosystems—knowledge of local environments expressed in local languages and cultures—is essential to the preservation of the global ecosystem, and that the massive language loss currently taking place is not only for a few humanists to lament, but a threat to human survival: “The idea that linguistic diversity should be preserved is not a sentimental tribute to some idealized past, but part of the promotion of sustainable, appropriate, and empowering development. The problem of language death is thus a ‘good’ problem, in that solving it would mean solving many other urgent and interrelated problems at the same time” (153).

It is eerie to read in one article after another such statements as “The survival of Susuami appears virtually impossible,” “…recently lost its last native speakers,” “The language’s extinction is inevitable,” “…the death of the last productive speaker of Mohegan Pequot in 1908,” “The death of Cajun French is predicted to occur by the year 2010,” “…interviews with the last two surviving semispeakers of Kore,” “…the Last Words of Esselen,” “…First—and Last—Notes on Wurrugu,” “…data collected from the last native speaker….” “…Pazeh, once the heritage language of a substantial speaker community in the Puli language region in Taiwan, appears to be down to its last fluent speaker.”

—SL

BIBLIOGRAPHY

A 300-item bibliography (1990-2000) is available on request.


Recent Publications

Inclusion of an item in TIC Talk does not necessarily mean we recommend it, or that we have seen it, though in most cases we have. It means that the article or book (sometimes by title alone) looks as if it might be of interest to our readers. Names in bold indicate people who are in some way related to UBS. Other bolding is for quick location of the general topic.

Bible Translation

Anna Patrick Brawley. 1999. “Translating the Unknown: The Case for Emending Semantically Disputed Forms in the Hebrew Bible.” Vanderbilt. Text criticism and comparative Semitics are used to analyze thirty-nine forms whose meanings cause difficulty for translation, in order to determine what the best reading may be. B. shows how the two methods can be used individually and together to clarify forms whose semantic denotation is disputed.

ANCIENT

Michael Knibb. 1999. Translating the Bible. The Ethiopic Version of the Old Testament. Oxford University Press. These Schweich Lectures treat the origin, history, and character of the Ethiopic translation of the Old Testament, a version of fundamental importance both in terms of the influence it has exerted on Ethiopian life and culture and as one of the daughter versions of the Greek Old Testament. Much of the book deals with the translation techniques of the version.


Nina L. Collins. 2000. The Library in Alexandria and the Bible in Greek. Brill. In a reexamination of the Letter of Aristeas and other relevant sources, C. argues that the earliest translation of the Pentateuch into Greek was completed in Alexandria in 281 BCE, and was indeed organized by Ptolemy II’s librarian Demetrius of Phalerum, as Aristeas reports, in the face of Jewish opposition. Ptolemy wanted the translation to increase his library, to attract scholars to Alexandria and to start his reign with an impressive event. This reappraisal has implications for evaluating the nature of the translation.


MODERN

Gerald T. Sheppard. 1999. “Issues in Contemporary Translation: Late Modern Vantages and Lessons from Past Epochs.” On the Way to Nineveh: Studies in Honor of George M. Landes. S.L. Cook and S. Winter, eds. Scholars Press. S. focuses on the question of how a particular text and its social function can engender proper expectations in the reader; he compares modern English translations of Psalms and Henry Ainsworth’s 17th c Psalms “in Prose and Metre,” exploring the problem of our “false confidence about the meaning of words.” We need to think carefully about the difference between the vagueness and the functional ambiguity of words in a specific context, the role of resonance within the intertext of Scripture, and the persistence of “the circumstances of the place” as distinct from merely the modern concern with historical origins.


Eric A. Hermanson. 2000. “Orality in Biblical Hebrew and Zulu—Implications for Translation.” Paper presented at SBL International Conference, Cape Town, South Africa. Close attention should be paid to the oral features in the Hebrew Bible and those of Zulu to ensure a more dynamic and fluent translation of the Hebrew into Zulu. H. looks at conceptual metaphors, riddles, proverbs, praise poetry, parallelism, word play, and ideophones. H. also presented “Proclaiming the Unknown God: Translating the Names of God in Zulu,” during the UBS Panel on Bible Translation at the same SBL meeting. He surveys the history of translation of names of God in Zulu, showing that the debate over whether Zulu titles refer to the God of the Bible or to someone else is still active. He points to the need for Zulu Christians to decide the issue. Electronic copies of both papers are available from Eric.

**Bible**

**GENERAL**


Amy Dockser Marcus. 2000. *The View from Nebo: How Archaeology Is Rewriting the Bible and Reshaping the Middle East*. Little, Brown and Company. Written for a general audience, this book examines the ways recent archaeology in the Middle East has changed our understanding of biblical history and texts.

H. Dan Beeby. 1999. *Canon and Mission*. Trinity Press. By former missionary and consultant to BFBS, B.’s book argues that the biblical canon, read as a whole, calls for mission, and mission emerges from and always has need of the biblical canon for its witness in and to the world.


---

No. 47 2000  TIC TALK - UBS Translation Information Clearinghouse Newsletter  Page 5

The Journal of Religion and Society is a new academic, peer-reviewed, electronic journal dedicated to the publication of scholarly research in religion and its diverse social dimensions. The home web address for the journal is: http://purl.org/JRS. Recent articles include: “Stepping In / Stepping Out: A Conversation between Ideological and Social Scientific Feminist Approaches to the Bible,” by Alice A. Keefe; and “Sodom and Gomorrah (Genesis 19:1-29) on the Internet: The Implications of the Internet for the Study of the Bible,” by Susanne Scholz.


A new publisher, Deo Publishing is initiating a series Guides to Advanced Biblical Research, edited by John Rogerson of Sheffield, intended to assist research-level students and scholars in providing surveys of recent research on particular fields, with annotated bibliographies and suggestions for the direction of further research.

Augustine and the Bible. 1999. P. Bright, ed. University of Notre Dame Press. This volume contains translations of a selection of essays from the book on which it is based, Bible de tous les temps, vol. 3, Saint Augustin et la Bible (Paris: Beauchesne, ed. Anne-Marie La Bonnardière), as well as additional essays prepared especially for the English edition. Essays are grouped in four sections, arranged chronologically: Augustine’s biblical initiation, his encounter with the hermeneutics of his native province of North Africa, his engagement in polemics, and his ministry. Three articles by Bonnardière open the collection; “Augustine’s Biblical Initiation,” “The Canon of Sacred Scripture,” and “Did Augustine Use Jerome’s Vulgate?” The Bible in Greek Christian Antiquity precedes this volume, and is an adaptation of the French vol. 2. English versions of additional volumes are in planning.


Encyclopedia of the Dead Sea Scrolls. 2000. L.H. Schiffman and J.C. VanderKam, eds. Oxford University Press. 460 entries cover topics relating to the scrolls, including texts, key words and concepts, scholars, scripts and sites.

Jacob A. Loewen. 2000. The Bible in Cross-Cultural Perspective. William Carey Library. L., anthropologist and former UBS translation consultant, incorporates many accounts of his translation experiences in this study of the cultural boundedness of the Bible and its readers. Topics include cosmology and spirit worlds, the concept of God and the sacred, and the significance of names.


BIBLICAL LANGUAGES

Hebrew

Nominal Clauses,” Janet Dyk and Eep Talstra, and “Macrosyntactic Functions of Nominal Clauses Referring to Participants,” Lénart de Regt.


Gary Rendsburg. 1999. “Confused Language as a Deliberate Literary Device in Biblical Hebrew Narrative.” Journal of Hebrew Scriptures 2 at http://www.arts.ualberta.ca/JHS/ R. presents a paradigm example of confused language in an ancient Near Eastern literary text, the Egyptian tale of “The Shipwrecked Sailor.” He explains the pertinent passage as a literary device in which confused and irregular syntax is used to portray the confusion of the moment of the shipwreck. He proceeds to treat seven biblical passages where similarly confused language conveys confusion, excitement, or bewilderment. Two have been treated previously in the secondary literature: 1 Sam 9:12-13 and Ruth 2:7. The five new ones are Gen 37:28, Gen 37:30, Judg 18:14-20, 1 Sam 14:21, and 1 Sam 17:38.


OT


Yairah Amit. 2000. Hidden Polemics in Biblical Narrative. Brill. A. identifies and analyzes hidden, as opposed to open or indirect, polemics in the Hebrew Bible, elucidating the techniques used to conceal them and to make the careful reader aware of their covert presence, and explaining the reasons for their concealment.


Women in the Hebrew Bible. 1999. A. Bach, ed. Routledge. 34 essays are grouped into seven sections: The social world of women in Ancient Israel, including “The Place of Women in the Israelite Cultus.” by P. Bird; Reading women into biblical narratives; Goddesses and women of magic; Rereading women in the Bible, including “Reading Strategies and the Story of Ruth,” by E. Greenstein; Sexual politics in the Hebrew Bible, including “Dealing/With/Women: Daughters in the Book of Judges,” by M. Bal; Feminist identities in biblical interpretation; and five commentaries on Numbers 5:11-31, including “Accusations of Adultery: A Study of Law and Scribal Practice in Numbers 5:11-31,” by M. Fishbane. Two bibliographies—Feminist Bibliography: Bible, and Feminist, Womanist, and Mujerista Theologies—are appended.


whose overarching purpose was to uncover the essence of Hebraic/Jewish religious thinking and gain understanding of its division into “parties” and traditions. Drawing on recent studies of Christianity as a Judaism, S. offers a perspective on the nature of ancient thought and the intellectual and spiritual heritage of European civilization.

Ronald S. Hendel and James A. Sanders. 2000. “The Most Original Bible Text. How to Get There.” Bible Review August 27/49,58. BR presents two views on the subject of text criticism of the Hebrew Bible: Hendel, in “Combine the Best from Each Tradition” (18-39), argues the case for incorporating superior variants into the text of the Bible, while Sanders, in “Keep Each Tradition Separate” (40-49,58), argues that a deeper understanding of the sources and their separate traditions is needed, and that judgments concerning variants, which tend to be influenced by academic biases, should remain in footnotes.


Yairah Amit. 1999. The Book of Judges: The Art of Editing. Brill. Published in 1992 in Hebrew, tr. by Jonathan Chipman. In the book of Judges, “the cycles of stories, exposition, ending, sequence, and repeated patterns—all serve the purpose of editing and thus combine into a significant statement.” A. aims to understand the process and goals of the editing, whose overarching purpose was to testify to the need for replacing the system of sign-bearing messengers-deliverers with ongoing leadership in the form of a king.


NT

F. Gerald Downing. 2000. Making Sense in (and of) the First Christian Century. Sheffield Academic Press. Examining the first Christian century with attention to its variety and distinctiveness, D. illuminates cultural features of early Christian society with a range of examples and suggests that people often tried to “make sense” in ways that seem on close inspection similar enough to ours.


S.E. Porter and D. Carson, eds. Sheffield Academic Press. Revised papers from the Biblical Greek Language and Linguistics Section of SBL. In Part I, papers discuss the integration of linguistics with a number of approaches in biblical studies, namely, literary analysis, historical criticism, and rhetorical criticism. The papers in Part II deal with specific texts, including a study of methods and techniques of oral composition in Philippians (C. Davis), a discussion of the first stages of a lexicon that details the argument structures of verbs (P. Danove), and a consideration of the use of statistical analyses of style to determine authorship (M. O’Donnell).

“Bibliographies of Selected Sources for the Study of Rhetoric and the New Testament.” http://newton.uor.edu/FacultyFolder/Hester/Journal/Bibliographies.html. The following online bibliographies are among those offered at the site of the e-journal Journal for the Study of Rhetorical Criticism of the New Testament: A Select Bibliography of Studies of Classical Rhetoric; A Select Bibliography of Pauline Studies; A Select Bibliography of Rhetorical and Related Studies of Paul; Galatians.


J.K. Elliott. 2000. A Bibliography of Greek New Testament Manuscripts. Cambridge University Press. In this considerably expanded and revised edition of Elliott’s 1989 Bibliography, some 5,000 new entries have been added, doubling the size of the first edition. The titles are predominantly those published in the past 150 years, and are set out under the categories of papyri.
majuscules, minuscules and lectionaries.


D.I. Brewer. 1999. “The Use of Rabbinic Sources in Gospel Studies (Review Article).” *Tyndale Bulletin* 50/2:281-98. In a review of three works that use rabbinic sources to illuminate the Gospels, B. highlights some of the problems and also the profit in appealing to rabbinic texts for such studies.


**Translation, Linguistics, Culture**

Postcolonial Translation Theory. 1999. S. Bassnet and H. Trivedi, eds. Routledge. This collection examines connections between postcolonial theory and translation studies. The essays, by contributors from Britain, the US, Brazil, India and Canada, examine the relationships between language and power across cultural boundaries, and the role of translation in redefining the meanings of culture and ethnic identity.


Paul Werth. 1999. *Text Worlds: Representing Conceptual Space in Discourse*. Pearson Education Inc. W. offers a text-world model for analyzing how readers see the worlds created by texts, and for representing the complex ways readers interact with texts, bringing shared knowledge of both language and the world to do so. The experience-based model incorporates knowledge by way of frames, or situation-types, the basic storage-unit of human experience.


Mathias Guenther. 1999. *Tricksters and Trancers: Bushman Religion and Society*. Indiana University Press. Because of its complexity and pervasive ambiguity, Bushman religion presents a challenge to the usual anthropological approaches to religion. G. explores Bushman religious belief and cosmology, particularly through the figures of the trickster and the trance dancer, the two central figures of Bushman religion. He sees the trickster as the embodiment of the ambiguity in Bushman mythology and cosmology and the trance dancer as the embodiment of ambiguity in ritual. He also brings in the “forager,” seeing foraging as an integral dynamic of Bushman religion: “the fluidity of Bushman religion is an ideological counterpart to the fluidity of Bushman society; the former provides the foragers with a set of cosmological and symbolic notions and a basic mental outlook that is congruent with foraging” (5).
**Bible in Church Slavonic Project**

The Saint-Petersburg School of Religion and Philosophy (SRPh, Russia) has undertaken a project of creating a full reliable e-text of the Bible in Church Slavonic (currently non-existent). Besides the Church Slavonic e-text, the software provides the possibility of comparing various Bible translations. More information can be found on the project’s site [http://jove.prohosting.com/~ggz/](http://jove.prohosting.com/~ggz/). The text in question is vital to Russian, Ukrainian, etc. religious traditions, and we feel that the successful completion of the project would benefit many people interested in the Bible text and in the Bible translations.

Communication from Yegor Nachinkin, CD project manager, SRPh

**Bible Translation List auf Deutsch**

Wieland Wilker extends the following invitation:


Was wird hier diskutiert: Alles, was mit deutschen Bibelübersetzungen zu tun hat – Übersetzungsprinzipien, Diskussion einzelner Verse in verschiedenen Übersetzungen, Neue Übersetzungsvorschläge, Textkritik, Mitteilungen über neue und alte Ausgaben, Verlage etc., Literaturhinweise, Webhinweise.

Ich würde mich freuen, wenn hier auch aktive Übersetzer mitmachen würden und diese Liste für erste Feldversuche benutzen.”

Um Mitglied dieser Mailingliste zu werden, sende bitte eine mail an: majordomo@majordomo.zfn.uni-bremen.de mit folgender Zeile im Body der mail: subscribe bibeluebersetzung

Webadresse: [http://www-user.uni-bremen.de/~wie/Mailingliste/index.html](http://www-user.uni-bremen.de/~wie/Mailingliste/index.html)

**OT Quotations in the NT Web Site**

Rick Jones has produced an informative web site with texts, graphs, comparative charts and explanatory comments. Sections include: Introduction; The LXX in Early Christian Writings; The LXX in the NT; All quotations in NT Order; All quotations in OT Order; Instances where the NT quotes the LXX against the MT; Instances where the NT follows the Hebrew meaning against the LXX; Appendix: Dead Sea Scrolls-LXX Alignments Against the MT; References and Links. [http://www.geocities.com/Heartland/Pines/7224/Rick/Septuagint/spindex.htm](http://www.geocities.com/Heartland/Pines/7224/Rick/Septuagint/spindex.htm)

**Qumran List**

The Qumran list is sponsored by the Divinity School of the University of St. Andrews in Scotland and is tied directly to courses offered at the University devoted to the study of early Judaism and Christian origins. The list will reopen for discussion February of 2001 for a semester course on the Dead Sea Scrolls, a survey of the DSS and related manuscript finds from the Judean Desert. The class will read and discuss the major sectarian texts from Qumran with a view toward understanding their place in Second Temple Judaism. Attention will also be given to the archaeological context of the Qumran discoveries, as well as to the importance of the scrolls for our understanding of the Hebrew Bible, the New Testament, and postbiblical Judaism. Related manuscript discoveries will also be studied, such as the letters and scrolls recovered from the time of the Bar Kokhba revolt. All reading assignments for the online course will be in English. The listowner and course instructor is Dr. James R. Davila, a lecturer in early Jewish studies at the University of St. Andrews. The primary focus of the list will be scholarly analysis and discussion of the assigned Dead Sea Scrolls and the questions that arise from the classroom materials distributed to the list and posted on the Web site. The web page for the Dead Sea Scrolls module and list is available at [http://www.st-andrews.ac.uk/~www_sd/qumran.html](http://www.st-andrews.ac.uk/~www_sd/qumran.html). An annotated bibliography for the Qumran texts and the topics to be covered in the module is accessible from this site, as well as links to related sites. The course and list will serve as a prologue to the “International Conference on the Dead Sea Scrolls as Background to Postbiblical Judaism and Early Christianity,” to be held June 26-28, 2001 at the University of St. Andrews, a meeting that aims to explore how the Scrolls contribute to our knowledge of the background of both rabbinic and noncanonical forms of Judaism, and of the origins and early development of Christianity. Abstracts of the papers will be posted on the Dead Sea Scrolls Conference web page ([http://www.st-andrews.ac.uk/~www_sd/qumran_conference.html](http://www.st-andrews.ac.uk/~www_sd/qumran_conference.html)).